LONDON BOROUGH OF BARKING AND DAGENHAM

DEPARTMENT OF CHILDREN'S SERVICES

CAPABILITY PROCEDURE FOR TEACHING STAFF AT MAINTAINED COMMUNITY, VOLUNTARY AIDED/CONTROLLED SCHOOLS

Department of Children's Services Town Hall Barking Essex IG11 7LU

GUIDANCEFOR HEADTEACHERS AND GOVERNING BODIES

INTRODUCTION

Following a number of changes, updated guidance to Governing Bodies and Headteachers is needed on capability procedures for teaching staff. Where teachers are experiencing difficulties, emphasis should be placed initially on providing informal support and advice within the school and, if appropriate, from external sources which may include the School Improvement Service. If these measures are not successful in bringing about sufficient improvement more formal procedures should be considered and this forms the substance of this policy.

This guidance is offered to Governing Bodies and Headteachers' as an example of good practice for adoption so as to secure fair and equitable treatment for all teachers within each school and across the Local Authority. These procedures have been agreed with the Secretaries of the Professional Associations locally on23rd May 2013Adoption and operation of these procedures should ensure that the Governing Body and Headteacher operate in accordance with the following provisions:-

- 1. The Education Acts, 1996, onwards and regulations made under them.
- 2. The Employment Rights Act, 1998 and other relevant employment legislation.
- **3.** The ACAS Code of Practice on disciplinary and grievance procedures.
- 4. The Conditions of Service for School Teachers in England and Wales.
- **5.** The Authority's Articles of Government for Schools.
- **6.** The Conditions of Service issued to teachers at the time of their employment and the letters which confirm their Contract of Employment.

Adoption of these procedures will ensure that the Governing Body will have the full support of the Local Authority in progressing cases.

If a maintained, voluntary aided or voluntary controlled Governing Body chooses to adopt alternative procedures then a copy of these procedures, together with the reasons for their adoption, should be sent to the Corporate Director of Children's Services who will advise the Secretaries of the Professional Associations. Any such alternative procedures will need to be the subject of their own consultation between the Governing Body and the Teachers' Professional Associations.

If an academy or free school within the local authority wants to adopt this policy, they should send a copy of this policy together with the consultation and its outcomes to the Corporate Director of Children's Services.

Governors must ensure that the adopted procedures are readily available to and understood by all members of the teaching staff.

This procedure relates exclusively to issues of the professional competence and performance of teachers in maintained community, voluntary-aided, voluntary controlled schools within the local authority. It does not relate to matters of

misconduct, or cases of ill-health. In addition it does not apply to Newly Qualified teachers or to Headteachers for whom there are separate procedures.

OVERVIEW OF THE PROCESS

A summary of the process is as follows:

1. INFORMAL STAGE

- 1.1. Meeting to set up the process for the informal stage
- **1.2.** Monitoring and Review Period minimum 10 working weeks
- **1.3.** Informal Review Meeting to discuss progress made and outcomes

2. FORMAL STAGE

2.1. Formal Capability Meeting to set up the process for the formal stage including the issue of a Written warning and setting out the formal processes including a right of appeal—5 days notice of the meeting

3. WRITTEN WARNING

- **3.1 Monitoring and Review Period**(to include any appeal)–12 weeks
- **3.2 Formal Review Meeting** to discuss progress made and outcome 5 days notice

If insufficient progress is made then an outcome of the formal Review Meeting can be the issue of a Final Written warning including that if insufficient improvement is made this could ultimately lead to dismissal. An appeal is allowed in respect of a Written Warning and the time for any appeal will run concurrently with the monitoring and review period. If a Written warning is issued and the process is to continue then.

4. FINAL WRTTEN WARNING

- 4.1 Monitoring and Review Period 4 weeks
- **4.2 Final Review Meeting** to discuss progress made and outcome 5 days notice

If insufficient progress is made then an outcome of the final Review Meeting can be a final written warning or dismissal. An appeal is allowed in respect of a final written warning or a decision to dismiss.

This is a maximum of 8 weeks for the Informal Stage and 14 weeks for the Formal Stage. A maximum total of 22 weeks.

5. STAFF DISMISSAL COMMITEE STAGE

- 5.1 Staff Dismissal Committee
- 5.2 Staff Appeal Committee

6. APPEALS PROCEDURE

- 6.1 Appeal against a final written warning
- 6.2 Appeal against a decision to dismiss

Capability procedures for teaching staff at Barking and Dagenham maintained community, voluntary aided and voluntary controlled schools

TITLE

This document shall be known as "The Capability Procedure for teaching staff at Barking and Dagenham maintained community, voluntary aided and voluntary controlled schools".

DEFINITIONS

- a) "The Education Acts" means the Education Act, 1996, as amended by any subsequent enactment.
- b) "The Authority" means the London Borough of Barking and Dagenham.
- c) "The Governors" means all members of the Governing Body of a school appointed from time to time, in accordance with the provisions of the Education Acts and in accordance with the decisions of the Authority and the provisions of the Articles and instrument of Government.
- d) "The Corporate Director of Children's Services" means the Chief Officer appointed as such by the Council of the London Borough of Barking and Dagenham, or his representative.
- e) "The Headteacher" means the person who has been appointed whether on a permanent, temporary or acting basis in accordance with the provisions of the Articles of Government.
- f) "The Teacher" means the person employed by the Authority who is paid in accordance with the scales of salaries for teachers in such schools. This includes teachers paid on unqualified, main scale, upper pay scale, advanced skills teachers scales and the leadership scale.
- g) "An HR adviser" means any person appointed by the governors to provide HR advice who is employed and qualified to do so by the council or a private or voluntary sector organisation.
- h) "An advisory teacher, adviser, senior or principal adviser" means the person appointed as such by the Council of the London Borough of Barking and Dagenham.
- i) "Lack of capability" means a situation in which a teacher fails consistently to perform his/her duties to a professionally acceptable standard.

APPLYING THE PROCEDURES

i) Scope of the Procedure

At every stage in the procedure concerns about the teacher's performance must be discussed with the teacher, who should be advised of the nature of the complaint against him/her and be given the opportunity to state his/her case before any decision is made.

At any stage in the procedure consideration may be given to allocating the teacher a different balance of duties or placing him/her in an alternative teaching post.

All formal proceedings shall be confidential and held in private. If a public statement is considered necessary it will normally be confined to the operative decision only.

ii) Role of Governors

Governors should not normally be involved with a capability procedure before the dismissal stage. The exception to this is where Governors are involved in considering an appeal against a final written warning. The use of Governors to hear any appeals against final written warnings should be limited to ensure a sufficient number of impartial Governors remain available for the Staff Dismissal Committee and the Staff Appeals Committee. The principle of natural justice means that those involved in the case at a later stage should have no prior knowledge of the case. Normally at least three Governors are required for the Staff Dismissal Committee and the Staff Appeals Committee.

iii) Representation at formal interview, evaluation meetings, dismissal hearing and appeal hearings

A teacher has anentitlement to be accompanied at all formal meetings as part of these procedures by a representative of his/herprofessional association, or a work colleague. If the teacher's chosen companion is not available at the time proposed for the meeting, and the teacher proposes an alternative that is reasonable and falls within five working days of the day proposed, the meeting should be rearranged to the time proposed by the teacher.

The Headteacher may be accompanied at any stage in the formal proceedings by a representative of the Corporate Director of Children's Services in an advisory capacity. The headteacher may also be accompanied at any formal meeting by an HR adviser, in an advisory capacity.

iv) Timescales

All stages of the formal procedure shall be carried out as promptly as possible in the interests of all the parties involved. Meetings will normally be held in term time unless there are exceptional reasons, and mutual agreement, to hold a meeting during a school closure period.

Reviewed September 2018

Notice of at least five working days must be given for all formal meetings as part of the capability procedures. The date of successive meetings should be provisionally planned at the preceding meeting where possible.

Where a teacher has exercised his/her right to appeal under this procedure the period of the review will nevertheless commence from the date of the final written warning.

If appropriate the review will be discontinued when the outcome of the appeal is known.

Where the teacher has the right of appeal, the appeal must be lodged by the teacher or his/her representative within five working days of receipt of the letter confirming the warning/dismissal.

v) Support for the teacher

Those colleagues that support the teacher should act in a coaching role, offering advice and guidance to help the teacher improve performance. If training courses or assistance from colleagues would be helpful these should be arranged as soon as possible but should not interrupt the timing of the procedure.

vi) Monitoring arrangements

Those monitoring the performance should offer feedback and guidance to help the teacher improve performance. Monitoring should include observations of a range of relevant duties and functions. An objective record of the monitoring should be kept and used to assist with the evaluation of performance.

vii) Written records

A written record should be made of all interviews with the teacher and any action taken following such an interview. Except in agreed circumstances any formal warnings should be disregarded after a specified period of satisfactory performance. These periods are two terms for a written warning and six terms for a final written warning (taken from the date of the issue of the warning).

When a complaint of lack of professional competence or failure in performance is upheld against a teacher and a warning is issued the teacher's written observations shall, if he/she requests, be included in the record alongside the warning.

Where, having reviewed the evidence, a complaint of lack of professional competence or failure in performance against a teacher is rejected by the Headteacher or Governors all references to the complaint shall be removed from the teacher's file.

viii) Staff who are absent through illness during the procedure

Sickness absence which is triggered by the capability procedure, and which management believe is likely to be long term, must be referred immediately to

Occupational Health to assess whether the teacher is fit for continued employment and/or to attend a meeting about their competency.

Short absences should not delay any part of the formal stage of the capability procedure although each case must be considered on its individual merits. Reasonable steps should be made to enable the teacher to attend meetings scheduled as part of these procedures. Where the teacher is unable to attend and having considered the medical evidence available, the meeting may proceed in the teacher's absence if delay would otherwise compromise the maximum time set aside for the procedure. In such circumstances the teacher's representative should still be allowed to attend the meeting, and a full account of the evaluation should be provided in the letter to the teacher confirming the decision taken.

ix) Decisions on continuing the procedure and recommending dismissal

The decision to continue a capability procedure or recommend dismissal should be taken by the Headteacher.

x) Disputes about the procedure

Any disagreements about the interpretation of this procedure, or the application of any related matters not covered in the procedure, must not delay the various elements of the capability procedure or the overall timetable determined as appropriate for handling that particular case.

xi) Grievances

In exceptional circumstances a teacher may raise a grievance about the behaviour of a Headteacher, or other manager, during the course of a capability procedure. Depending on the circumstances it may be appropriate to suspend the procedure until the grievance can be considered by Governors. Such a delay should only be considered where there is a strong indication that the teacher has been mistreated and consideration should be given to bringing in another manager to deal with the capability case. Any records should be passed to the new manager and if appropriate the case should be continued within the same timetable.

xii) Union Representatives

No action beyond the informal stage shall be commenced against a teacher who is a union/professional association representative without the Headteacher having first discussed the matter with a senior representative or full time official of that union/professional association.

xiii) Serious Cases

In extreme cases where the Headteacher considers that the education of pupils is jeopardised he/she, after consultation with the Corporate Director of Children's Services, may decide to move directly to the Formal Procedure with the consideration of a final warning. In such cases, the period given for

Reviewed September 2018

improvement will be no more than 4 weeks, and the teacher should be advised to consult with his professional association as a matter of urgency.

THE PROCEDURES

1. INFORMAL STAGE

1.1 Meeting to set up the informal process – 5 days notice

When a teacher is believed to be under-performing the Headteacher should investigate and gather evidence and then discuss with the teacher the inadequacies of his/her work. In large schools and secondary schools the head of department or other appropriate line manager should be involved in the discussion. Clear written guidance, including outlining the performance problem a job description, on what is expected of the teacher (the improvement that is required) and how he/she will be monitored (timescales and a review date) should be given, and the teacher should be advised to consult with his/her professional association. Written copies of all advice may be kept. The teacher should work under the supervision of a senior member of staff who is in a position to assist him/her.

- **1.1.2** It may also be appropriate for the Headteacher to seek advice from an external source which may include the School Improvement Service at this stage.
- **1.1.3** Attendance at in-service courses, and/or opportunities to observe or work alongside colleagues should be arranged where it is thought these would be helpful and practical and the teacher wishes to take up this offer.
- **1.1.4** The Headteacher should ensure that it is clear to everyone involved that all proceedings at this stage are informal.
- **1.1.5** Discussions at this stage must not harass the teacher or turn into a formal interview however you should inform the teacher of the following:
 - make it clearly understood that failure to improve will lead to the formal stage.
 - The teacher and/or his/her representative should have the opportunity to comment and their views should be noted in writing.

1.2 Monitoring and review period – 10 Working Weeks

- **1.2.1** The support provided by an external agency which may include the School Improvement Service should include:
 - a) advice from an advisory teacher/adviser; The advisory teacher's/advisor's role should include suggesting targets for improvement and strategies for achieving these.
 - b) preferential treatment for financial support to attend a relevant course or courses, where this is supported by the school;
 - c) The opportunity to be released to observe colleagues in other schools, where this is thought to be practical and relevant.

Explain any support that will be available (normally provided by the school and external partners), and how performance will be monitored

over the following weeks;

d) To identify the timetable for improvement (the monitoring and review period) and agree a date for the next/final evaluation meeting

1.3 Informal Stage Review Meeting – 5 days notice

The teacher's performance should be reviewed after a period which should be Minimum of Ten working weeks, and should the teacher make satisfactory progress or better, the assistance and supervision may be ended or modified. If, however, it appears that more formal proceedings are required, consultation with a nominated LA Link Officer and HR should take place before further action is taken.

2. FORMAL STAGE

2.1 Formal capability meeting – 5 days notice

This meeting initiates the formal stage of the capability procedure. At this stage any external sources including the School Improvement Service should beinformed so that a planof support and advice can be arranged. The formal stage of the procedure provides anopportunity to deal with more serious problems in a structured way. The teacher should therefore be advised to consult with his/her professional association

- **2.1.2** The teacher may be accompanied at the formal interview by a representative of his/her professional association or a work colleague.
- **2.1.3** The formal interview allows the teacher to prepare a response about his/her performance and make a case. At least five working days notice mustbe given for the interview.
- **2.1.4** The interview may provide new information or put a different slant on evidence collected. If it becomes clear that further investigation is needed the interview should be adjourned for an appropriate length of time to allow thisto happen.
- **2.1.5** A decision should be made after all the facts and any representations from the teacher have been considered. The Headteacher should adjourn the meeting briefly to consider the appropriate option before delivering a decision to the teacher.
- **2.1.6** There are two possible outcomes of the formal capability meeting.

(The first option is only relevant where new information, a different slant on the information collected, or further investigation suggests that the matter is not as serious as it first seemed).

• Option 1: drop the matter (where there is no evidence of lack of capability)

(The following option is relevant to any case where continued concern

about the standard of performance is justified).

• Option 2: continue the formal process with the issue of writtenwarning and the right of appeal

3. WRITTEN WARNING

3.1. Monitoring and Review Period – 12 weeks

The period of assessment for a writtenwarning will be ten working weeks. Regular observation, monitoring and evaluation of performance, with guidance, training if necessary, and support to the teacher. Where a teacher has exercised his/her right to appeal, the period of the review will nevertheless commence from the date of the written warning. If appropriate the review will be discontinued when the outcome of the appeal is known.

- **3.1.2** Where a written warning is issued, the Headteacher should use the remainder of the formal review meeting to:
 - identify the professional shortcomings;
 - give clear guidance on the improved standard of performance needed to end the capability procedure;
 - explain any support that will be available (normally provided by the school and external partners), and how performance will be monitored over the following weeks;
 - to identify the timetable for improvement (the monitoring and review period) and agree a date for the next/final evaluation meeting; and
 - make it clearly understood that failure to improve may ultimately lead to dismissal
 - the teacher and/or his/her representative should have the opportunity to comment and their views should be noted in writing.
- **3.1.3** A letter should be sent to the teacher immediately after the formal capability meetingrecording the result of the investigations, the main points discussed at the meeting, confirming the decision and level of warning issued, and any right of appeal.
- **3.1.4** Any appeal must be made within five working days. The appeal will be heard by Governors. The appeal process must not interrupt the progress of the procedure, unless the appeal decision leads to the matter being reconsidered.
- **3.1.5** If, following the issue of a written warning and the relevant assessment period, performance has not improved, the matter will progress to a final written warning. Thereafter, in cases where performance remains unacceptable, a decision may be taken to dismiss.
- **3.1.6** The support provided by the school should include the designation of a fellow teacher as a mentor to: assist in setting developmental targets, oversee training and act as a confidential counsellor.
- **3.1.7** The support provided by an external agency (which may include the School Improvement Service should include:

- a) advice from an advisory teacher/adviser; The advisory teacher's/advisor's role should include suggesting targets for improvement and strategies for achieving these.
- b) preferential treatment for financial support to attend a relevant course or courses, where this is supported by the school;
- c) the opportunity to be released to observe colleagues in other schools, where this is thought to be practical and relevant.
- **3.1.8** Notes of discussions with the advisory teacher/adviser should be kept and both parties should have signed copies. These should be confidential and should not form part of any monitoring of the teacher's work or part of the decision at the end of the period.
- **3.1.9** Monitoring of the teacher's work should be undertaken separately by botha member of the senior management team of the school; andasenior or principal adviser from the School Inspection Service (Both should keep detailed notes of observations made; following discussion these records should be signed by both teacher and the monitor and each should have a copy).
- **3.1.10** At the end of the designated period both the member of the senior management team and the senior / principal adviser should write an assessment of the teacher's work, and should provide the teacher with a copy of this.

3.2 Formal Review Meeting – 5 days notice

If insufficient progress is made then an outcome of the formal Review Meeting can be the issue of a Final Written warning including that if insufficient improvement is made this could ultimately lead to dismissal. An appeal is allowed in respect of a Final Written Warning.

4. FINAL WRITTEN WARNING

4.1 Monitoring and Review Period – 4 weeks

The period of assessment for a final written warning will begin a maximum assessment period of four weeks.

- **4.1.2** Formal monitoring, evaluation, guidance and support should continue for this period. Arrangements for this should be explained at the meeting.
- 4.1.3 If a final written warning is issued, the teacher must be told clearly that failure to achieve an acceptable standard may result in dismissal.
 Whatever the decision at the evaluation meeting, structured feedback should be provided including a letter to the teacher to confirm the key points. If the
 - be provided including a letter to the teacher to confirm the key points. If the capability procedure is continuing this letter should include:
 - a) the nature of the failure of performance and the areas in which improvement is required; the implications of a failure to improve;
 - b) the criteria which will be used to judge future competence;

- c) the programme of support which will be provided by both the school and external agencies including the School Improvement Service;
- d) the timescale within which improvements must be made.
- **4.1.4** Any appeal against a final written warning must be made within five working days. Where a teacher has exercised his/her right to appeal, the period of the review will nevertheless commence from the date of the final written warning. If appropriate the review will be discontinued when the outcome of the appeal is known.

4.2 Final Review Meeting – 5 days notice

Formal Review meeting between the Headteacher and the teacher to assess performance over the previous weeks. The teacher may be accompanied at this meeting by a representative of his professional association or a work colleague. At least five working days notice of the meeting must be given. If the level of performance has been satisfactory and targets have been met, the capability procedure can end here. A letter must be sent from the Headteacher to confirm this, although a record of the written warning issued will remain on file for the specified period.

4.3.1 If insufficient progress has been made then an outcome of the final Review Meeting can be a recommendation to Governors or appropriate body for dismissal. An appeal is allowed in respect of a decision to dismiss.

5. STAFFDISMISSAL COMMITTEE STAGE

- 5.1 The Governing Body should set up a Staff Dismissal Committee with at least three governors. This must hear the representations and recommendations brought by the Headteacher conducting the capability procedure. The Staff Dismissal Committee should also consider any representations that the teacher (and/or his representative) may wish to make.
- 5.2 The Governing Body should also set up a Staff Appeal Committee to hear any appeal against a written or final warning given as part of this procedure. None of the Governors on the Staff Dismissal Committee should be on the Staff Appeal Committee.
- 5.3 Where a capability case is referred to the Governing Body a meeting of the Staff Dismissal Committee shall be convened, within fifteen working days of notification from the Headteacher, to consider the case.
- 5.4 The teacher shall be given not less than five working days' notice in writing, of the meeting and shall be informed of the nature of the complaints about his/her performance, the date, time, venue and purpose of the meeting. The teacher should be advised of his/her right to be accompanied by a professional association representative or work colleague.
- 5.5 Not less than five working days before the date of the meeting the teacher shall be provided with two copies of all documents/written evidence and a list of the persons to be called in support of the complaint.

- **5.6** The Staff Dismissal Committee will be advised to follow a procedure for continuing the meeting as set out below:
 - The Corporate Director of Children's Services shall appoint an appropriate
 officer to attend the meeting and advise the Governors on procedures and
 to act on his/her behalf as Clerk to the proceedings. The Staff Dismissal
 Committee should consider this advice prior to making its decision.
 - The Headteacher will put the case against the teacher and shall call witnesses as necessary in the presence of the teacher and his/her representative.
 - The teacher and/or his/her representative shall have the opportunity to ask questions of the Headteacher or any witnesses on the evidence presented.
 - The teacher or his/her representative will put their case calling witnesses and/or documentary evidence as he/she considers appropriate.
 - (Except in exceptional circumstances, agreed by all parties present, the mentor and any external support teacher/adviser shall <u>not</u> be called as witnesses by either side).
 - The Headteacher shall have the opportunity to ask questions of any witness called by the teacher on the evidence presented.
 - The members of the Staff Dismissal Committee shall have the opportunity at any stage to ask questions of both parties, their representatives and witnesses.
 - Witnesses will normally be asked to leave the meeting once they have given their evidence, and been asked any appropriate questions.
 - Before summing up, either party may, in appropriate circumstances, recall and re-examine any witness. Thereupon the other party shall also have the right of re-examination.
 - The Headteacher shall have the opportunity to sum up but must not introduce new evidence at this stage.
 - The teacher, or his/her representative, shall have the opportunity to make the final summing up but must not introduce new evidence at that stage.
 - Both parties and all witnesses shall then withdraw, leaving the Governors to deliberate in private. The officer representing the Corporate Director of Children's Services shall remain with the Governors in order to advise on procedural matters and to record their decisions. If there is need to recall either side to clarify points of uncertainty then both parties will return, even if only one side is involved. Witnesses may be recalled and re-examined by the Governors in the presence of both parties.
 - Where possible the decision will be indicated to both parties verbally after the meeting. The decision will be confirmed in writing as soon as possible, but within five working days.
 - The Governors may decide to take one of the following courses of action:
 - to dismiss the teacher;
 - to halt the capability procedures as there is insufficient evidence of a lack of capability.

6. APPEALS PROCEDURE

6.1 Against written warnings

In the event of the teacher wishing to appeal against a writtenwarning issued by the Headteacher, written notice of the appeal, together with the grounds upon which the appeal is based should be lodged within five working days of the date of the letter confirming the issue of the warning with the Clerk to the Governing Body.

- **6.1.2** The appeal shall be heard by the Staff Appeals Committee of the Governing Body within ten working days wherever possible.
- **6.1.3** At least five working days' notice of the date and place of the hearing will be given to the teacher. The teacher may be accompanied by his/her professional association representative or a work colleague. The Staff Appeals Committee will normally comprise of three members.
- **6.1.4** The process to be followed at an Appeal Hearing should be the same as for a Staff Dismissal Committee (see XXX).
- **6.1.5** At the Appeal Hearing, Governors must hear representations from both parties before making a decision. Governors must not use information received outside the Capability Procedure process as part of their decision making process.
- **6.1.6** The Staff Appeals Committee may choose to:
 - Dismiss the appeal
 - Impose a lesser sanction
 - Uphold the appeal
- **6.1.7** The Appeals Committee shall not be empowered to impose a more severe sanction than originally imposed by the Headteacher.
- **6.1.8** The decision of the Appeals Committee shall be confirmed in writing to the teacher within five working days. There is no further internal right of appeal.

6.2 Appeals against Dismissal

Where the Staff Dismissal Committee has decided to dismiss the teacher, the teacher has the right of appeal to the Staff Appeals Committee of the Governing Body. This Committee would normally consist of three members of the Governing Body and, in any case, of no fewer members than the Staff Dismissal Committee. Any decision to appeal should be communicated in writing to the Clerk to the Governors within five working days of the letter confirming dismissal.

- **6.2.1** Governors involved in the Staff Dismissal Committee must not be involved in any appeal against the decision of the Staff Dismissal Committee.
- **6.2.2** The teacher shall be given at least five working days' notice of the time and place of the appeal, in writing and may be accompanied by a professional association representative or a work colleague.

- **6.2.3** The Staff Appeals Committee may decide to:
 - Uphold the dismissal of the teacher
 - Impose a lesser sanction
 - Reinstate the teacher
- **6.2.4** The decision of the Appeals Committee shall be confirmed in writing to theteacher within five working days. There is no further internal rightof appeal.